

Proof:

$p(a|b|xy|z)$  non-signalling

with PR box  $p(a|b|xy) = \begin{cases} \frac{1}{2} & : a \oplus b = xy \\ 0 & : \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$

compute:  $P_{AE}(a|e|xz) = \sum_b p(a|b|xy|z) \stackrel{\text{N.S.}}{=} \sum_b p(a|b|x\tilde{y}|z)$

i) choose  $\tilde{y} = 0 \Rightarrow a \oplus b = x \cdot 0 = 0 \quad \forall x$

hence  $P_{AE}(a|e|xz) = P_{AE}(a|e|z) = p(a|a|e|00z) = p(a|a|e|10z)$

ii) choose  $\tilde{y} = 1 \Rightarrow a \oplus b = x$  with  $x = 1$

$\Rightarrow P_{AE}(a|\bar{a}|e|11z) = p(a|a|e|01z) = p(a|a|e|10z)$   
from i) independent of  $x$   $= p(a|a|e|00z)$

compute:  $P_{BE}(b|e|yz) = \sum_a p(a|b|xy|z) \stackrel{\text{N.S.}}{=} \sum_a p(a|b|x\tilde{y}|z)$

$\Rightarrow$  same arguments, however:

$P(\bar{b}|b|e|11z) = p(b|b|e|00z) = \dots$

and also  $P_{BE}(b|e|yz) = P_{BE}(b|e|z)$

compare Marginal  $AE \neq BE$  we have:

$P(\bar{b}|b|e|11z) = p(b|b|e|00z) = p(b|\bar{b}|e|11z) \text{ etc...}$

$\Rightarrow P_{BE}(b|e|z) = P_{BE}(\bar{b}|e|z) \quad (*)$

From normalization  $\Rightarrow \sum_{b \in \{0,1\}} P_{BE}(b|e|z) = 1 \quad \forall z$

$\Rightarrow \sum_b P_{BE}(b|e|z) = \frac{1}{2} \quad \forall z$

$\Rightarrow P(b=e) = \frac{1}{2} \quad \square$