

Appendix C: The Expert Data

This appendix explicates the details regarding the data contributed by the experts for the religion comparison experiments in chapters 4 and 5. The first part contains a copy of the instructions that were provided to the experts. The second part includes the classes themselves.

C.1 Instructions for Participants

We run a research on fully automated detection of similar features within distinct but related domains. With your kind help, we would have the opportunity to validate our computational information-retrieval methods through a comparative investigation of religions.

Please follow the instructions below. Thank you very much for your contribution!

Zvika Marx, student in neural computation Ph.D. program

For the following five religions – Buddhism, Christianity, Hinduism, Islam, Judaism – you are requested to provide a simplified framework for comparing each two of them (Buddhism-Christianity, Buddhism-Hinduism, etc.) with one another.

For each one of the possible 10 pairwise comparisons, please write down in English:

- (I) A list of titles for the main features and aspects that are similar (or resembling, or parallel, or equivalent, or analogous) in the two religions under examination.**
- (II) For each such a feature, for each one of the two religions under comparison, write down a list of key-terms that are associated with this feature.**

Notes:

(1) **Additional Guidelines:**

- (a) Please, try to address features that are commonly discussed in the literature and to use key-terms that are relatively wide spread. Please avoid the use of very rare terms as much as possible (even if they are much more to the point).
- (b) Feature titles and key-terms may repeat (over different religion comparisons, repetition of the same key-term for both religions in the same feature etc.). However, keep in mind that we have an interest in exploring unique properties of each comparison.
- (c) It would be much helpful if you could specify in brackets alternative spelling and strictly interchangeable terms to your key-terms, whenever such exist.
- (d) The key-terms may definitely be names of people, places etc., but please try thinking also of key-terms that are not names, whenever such exist.

(2) Expected numbers of features and key-terms (rough, non-definite guidelines):

- * Features – minimum: about 5; maximum: about 15 (for each pair)
- * Key-terms – minimum: 2-3; maximum: about 10 (for each religion in each pair)

(3) This task is not meant to be laborious and the output is not expected to become an ultimate reference for comparative religion studies. It is more of getting a view on what you might have in mind now. Please do not consult the literature too extensively (unless you do it for your own reasons). Do concentrate on currently available knowledge. Whenever pointing out additional features and key-terms is not fluent, tend to the minimum values specified in (2) above.

- (4) We would like very much to get your contribution also with respect to religions about which you feel less confidence, even if in such cases you are significantly less accurate and detailed. You are requested to fill in a self-estimated indication to your level of expertise for each comparison, so we could potentially monitor consequential effects if any.
- (5) Although the list of all 10 pairwise religion comparisons is what we are after, partial contribution (resulting from lack of time, lack of knowledge, or any other reason) is still very much welcomed.
- (6) Your name will not be associated with your specific contribution. Please let us know if you prefer not to be acknowledged at all.
- (7) We might come back to you with a request to feedback in a later stage in our research. However, by participation in this stage you do not make any commitment to take part in the later stages.
- (8) We would like very much to get comments and suggestions regarding your impressions of taking part in this procedure. We would be happy to explain and discuss further any aspect of our research.
-

The instructions above were followed by 10 pages, each containing a table such as the following, where the words **Religion1** and **Religion2** are respectively replaced by the following religion pairs:

- (1) **Buddhism** and **Christianity**, (2) **Buddhism** and **Hinduism**, (3) **Buddhism** and **Islam**,
 (4) **Buddhism** and **Jusaism**, (5) **Christianity** and **Hinduism**, (6) **Christianity** and **Islam**,
 (7) **Christianity** and **Jusaism**, (8) **Hinduism** and **Islam**, (9) **Hinduism** and **Jusaism**
 and (10) **Islam** and **Jusaism**,

1	Religion1	Religion2
Features of Similarity	Key-terms Lists	

Level of confidence – please indicate a number between 1 to 5 _____

1 – indicates minimal confidence (features and key-terms are based on very partial knowledge or even on mere intuition, I am not sure if many relevant aspects are covered, etc.)

5 – indicates maximal confidence (features and key-terms are based upon comprehensive knowledge, they seem to me as representing well the whole range of potential correspondences, etc.)

C.2 Religion-Related Term Classes Contributed by Experts

C.2.1 The Data Contributed by Expert I

Table C.1: We present the data contributed by this expert, as a cross-comparison involving all five religions. The expert provided the titles for the aspects of similarity, i.e. classes, and the list of religion pairs to which each similarity aspect is relevant. This data was conveyed to us in printed form, so we show the final version, after filtering out about 30% of the terms and further editorial changes, such as spelling modifications (the data from the other 2 experts, presented in the following sections, allows more detailed trace of filtered terms and changes that have been made).

Buddhism	Christianity	Hinduism	Islam	Judaism
Scriptures. (relevant for all religion pairwise comparisons)				
pali~canon koan mandala mantra sutra	new~testament old~testament apostle bible john luke matthew paul revelation	gita mahabharata upanishad vedas	hadith mohamad shariah sunnah	halachah mishnah siddur talmud tanakh torah
Beliefs and Ideas (relevant for all religion pairwise comparisons)				
buddha~nature noble~truths dharma dukkha emptiness nirvana reincarnation suffer tantra	jesus~christ love~of~god devil god cross fish heaven hell resurrection trinity	holy~people trimurti moksha atman brahman re~ incarnation	pillars~of~ faith muhammad~the~pr~ ophet~of~allah tawhid allah heaven hell	judgment divine~creation mount~sinai no~other~god principles~of~faith temple~mount temple hell yarmulke exodus heaven menorah talit tefilin teshuvah
Ritual, Prayer and Holy Days (relevant for all religion pairwise comparisons, less Christianity~Hinduism)				
Gift meditation sacrifice stupa	eucharist baptism christmas confess sunday	kumbhamela festival meditation puja sacrifice	id~al~fitr charity fast friday haj kaabah mecah prayer ramadan	atonement read~torah circumcision passover prayer synagogue tefilin
Society and Politics (relevant for the following comparisons: Budd.~Judd., Chris.~Hind., Chris.~Islam., Hind.~Islam, Islam~Judd.)				
Dalai~lama bodhisattva lama monk	catholic church minister monk priestly protestant rome vatican	brahmin caste sadhu	calif ali imam shariah sheikh shiah sufi sunnah	hasid saint ashkenazim community david prophet rabbi sephardim Solomon synagogue
Establishments (relevant for the following comparison only: Christianity~Hinduism)				
monastery school temple	bishop cardinal church pope priestly	caste gift priest temple	imam mosque	high~priest temple priest levi mikveh rabbi synagogue yeshivah
Mysticism (relevant for all religion pairwise comparisons)				
meditation nirvana samadhi tantra	eucharist crucifixion love miracle saint suffer	ashram chakra darshan guru yoga	sufi	zohar ezekiel angel ari daniel kabalah malchut messiah sefirot shechinah
Learning and Religious Education (relevant for the following : Budd.~Chris., Budd.~Islam, Chris.~Islam, Hind.~Islam, Hind.~Judd.)				
meditation monastery monk sutra	divinity moral theology university	ashram guru	sheikh	gemara parsha talmud yeshivah
Names and Places (relevant for the following religion comparisons: Budd.~Hind., Chris.~Islam., Chris.~Judd., Islam~Judd.)				
siddhartha~ gautama buddha	jesus~christ john~the~baptist jordan~river bethlehem jerusalem jesus john luke luther mary matthew paul rome thomas	varanasi arjuna brahma durga ganesh kali Krishna rama shakti shiva vishnu	jerusalem ali baghdad istanbul madinah mecah mohamad	isaac joseph jacob abraham adam jerusalem moises

C.2.2 The Data Contributed by Expert II

The second expert has provided the data presented in Tables C.2–C.5.

Table C.2: Buddhism–Christianity expert classes.

	Buddhism	Christianity
<i>Life after death</i>	Reincarnation, nirvana (nibbana) karma samsara	Resurrection heaven hell the day of judgement
<i>Creatures that have special forces or abilities</i>	Buddha Bodhisattva Deva	God Jesus Devil Angel
<i>Cause and effect</i>	The law of karma the cycle of reincarnation samsara	Sin – punishment good act – reward
<i>Sacred places</i>	Temple monastery the places related to the life of the Buddha	Jerusalem Betlehem church cathedral graveyard
<i>Recommended acts</i>	Dharma (dhamma) meditation ascetism bhavana the way (faith, strength, mindfulness, concentration, wisdom) merit making pilgrimage	Praying reading Bible good works converting believing
<i>Sacred times</i>	Full-moon day the day of the birth and enlightenment of the Buddha	Christmas Easter Pentacostal day Sunday
<i>Special places for religious experts</i>	Sangha monastery	Monastery convent monk nun
<i>Sacred texts</i>	Tripitaka Kanjur Tanjur	The Bible New Testament Old Testament

Table C.3: Christianity–Hinduism expert classes.

	Christianity	Hinduism
<i>Trimurti</i>	Father Son and the Holy Ghost	Brahma Vishnu Shiva
<i>sacred texts</i>	The Bible Old Testament New Testament	Vedas Upanishads Mahabharata Brahmasutra

Table C.4: Buddhism–Hinduism expert classes.

	Buddhism	Hinduism
<i>reincarnation</i>	nirvana (nibbana) karma samsara	Moksha samsara karma
<i>Meditation</i>	Dharma (dhamma)	Dharma atman Brahman yoga
<i>Ascetism</i>	Sangha monastery pilgrimage	Pilgrimage meditation yoga
<i>Guru</i>	Buddha Bodhisattva Deva	Yogi ascetics brahminis mahatmas
<i>Sacred texts</i>	Tripitaka Kanjur Tanjur	Vedas Upanishads Mahabharata Brahmasutra
<i>Syneretism</i>	Folk religion	Indus Veda Aryan folk religion

Table C.5: Christianity–Islam expert classes.

	Christianity	Islam
<i>Transcendent creatures</i>	God, Jesus, angel, devil	Allah, Muhammed, angels devil, profets
<i>Life after death</i>	Resurrection heaven hell the day of the judgement	Predestination paradise hell the day of the judgement
<i>Holy scriptures</i>	Bible	Qur'an hadith
<i>Sacred palces</i>	Jerusalem, Betlehem church, graveyard	Mecca, Medina mosque, Ka'ba
<i>Sacred times</i>	Cristmas, Easter Sunday, the Pentacostal Day	Ramadan Friday
<i>Recommended acts</i>	Praying reading Bible	Praying, pilgrimage (haji) alms-giving, reading Qur'an visiting mosque fasting durin Ramadan
<i>Acts that are not recommended</i>	Sin, adultery violence working on Sunday obeying parents not admiring something that belongs to someone else obeying God and not mentioning his name without a reason	Drinking alcohol eating pig relationships between opposited sexes (if not relative = adultery)

C.2.3 The Data Contributed by Expert III

Table C.6: Here the data is presented as cross-comparison involving three religions. The terms that are in fact valid for the triple comparison are in bold face. For the other terms, a single letter in square brackets marks the religion to the comparison with which they are relevant, whenever confusion might arise. Terms, term parts and similarity aspects that were not used in the evaluation process are marked by strikethrough line.

	Christianity	Islam	Judaism
<i>Monotheism</i>	God You shall have no other gods before Me Idolatry	Allah, La ilaha illa Allah (No god but God) Shirk (=idolatry)	God, Yahweh Elohim You shall have no other gods before Me Idolatry
<i>Scripture</i>	Bible, New Testament Gospels, Revelation	Qur'an, Revelation (wahy, tanzil)	Torah, Tanakh Bible, Revelation
<i>Holy community</i>	Church	Ummah	Holy people (Am Qadosh) Israel (Yisrael)
<i>Prophets/ prophecy</i>	Prophets Moses (Moshe) [j] Elijah [j], Isaiah [j] Jeremiah [j] "The Twelve" [j]	Prophet (nabi) Messenger (rasul) Muhammad	Prophets Elijah [c], Isaiah [c] Jeremiah [c] Moses (Moshe) [i]
<i>Sacred Land</i>	Jerusalem, Rome	Mecca, Medina, Jerusalem	Israel Jerusalem
<i>Prayer and ritual</i>	Prayer , mass [i] eucharist [i] pilgrimage [i] rosary [j]	Prayer, Salat (namaz) du'a , Hijrah [c] Ziyarah [c] Pilgrimage [c]	Prayer, daven
<i>Holy days, times</i>	Christmas Epiphany Good Friday Easter Pentecost	Ramadan 'Id 'Id al-Fitr 'Id al-Adha (Qurban Bairam, etc.)	Sabbath (Shabbat) Yom Kippur Rosh ha-Shanah
<i>Denominational, sectarian divisions</i>	Roman Catholic Eastern Orthodox Protestant Arian Monophysite Nestorian	Sunni Shi'i (Shi'ite) Twelver Shi'i Isma'ili (Sevener Shi'i) Khariji (Kharijite)	Rabbanite, Karaite Hasidic, Mitnagid Reform (Progress, Liberal), Orthodox, Conservative Reconstructionist
<i>Mediator(s), viz between God and humans</i>	Jesus Christ incarnation atonement saints intercession	Muhammad Wali (pl. Awliya' = "saints") Ali, Husayn Imams, intercession	
<i>Atonement</i>	Jesus Christ, Lamb of God, Substitutionary atonement, repentance confession absolution (sacrament)		Temple sin offering prayer repentance Day of Atonement
<i>Emphasis on law</i>		Shari'ah, fiqh	Torah, halakah
<i>Circumcision</i>		Circumcision	Circumcision Bris (Brit)
<i>Holy war</i>	Crusade, Just War	Jihad	Holy War